

Social Audit Team Report in Hani Elezit

Monitored project "Regulation of the park on "Isa Berisha"
street (paving, sidewalk, public lighting, greenery)

This report was prepared by the DEMOS project, implemented by Helvetas Swiss Intercooperation Kosovo.

Disclaimer: The findings and conclusions expressed in this report do not necessarily represent the views of the European Union, Switzerland, Sweden and Norway.

The objective of the DEMOS project

The Project for Decentralization and Support of Municipalities (DEMOS) supports 38 municipalities of the Republic of Kosovo in achieving a more democratic local governance and better municipal management. The DEMOS project also supports the Government of Kosovo in developing policies that are more favorable for rule-based financing for municipalities.

The DEMOS project is currently in its third phase (2022-2025) building on top of successes made since the start of the project in 2014. The project is co-financed by the European Union in Kosovo, Switzerland, Sweden and Norway and implemented by Helvetas Swiss Intercooperation Kosovo.

DEMOS support to Kosovo municipalities is part of the Performance Grant, as a tool that guarantees support for well-performing municipalities.

Municipal performance is evaluated through the Municipal Performance Management System (MPMS) of the Ministry of Local Government Administration (MLPA).

Furthermore, in order to increase the performance of certain indicators, DEMOS provides technical assistance to municipalities. A special focus of the project is the support to the central government, with DEMOS being focused on providing assistance in the drafting of policies for a more favorable framework for decentralized governance.

According to the first component of the project, DEMOS III aims to open the data for a wider public review of municipal performance and to initiate social audits to monitor the impact of the Municipal Performance Grant (MPG) projects on citizens. The purpose of this intervention is to involve civil society organizations and citizens in conducting social audits to monitor Municipal Performance Grant (MPG) projects implemented by municipalities.

To mitigate the reliability risks of Performance Grant funds, and at the same time to monitor the impact of projects on citizens, DEMOS has established social audits within the Municipal Performance Grant (in the system). Social audits will also include monitoring the performance and processes of project planning at the municipal level. The project will support the development of sampling tools and methodologies, including training to successfully conduct such social audits. The aforementioned Social Audits will be financed by a portion of the Municipal Performance Grant funds and will be developed by civil society organizations. For this, DEMOS will partner with the main CSOs (Civil Society Organizations).

BIRN Kosovo is an independent, non-governmental organization whose objectives are to inform citizens and contribute to the process of democratic transition in the country, promote accountability, rule of law and policy reform. BIRN Kosovo particularly aims to serve as an overseer of public institutions, monitoring the work of governing and public institutions. In addition, by producing quality and unbiased TV debates and by training youths in argumentative and debate skills, BIRN aims to promote and encourage a culture of debate in Kosovo. BIRN's vision is to secure its position as the principal organization of investigative journalism in Kosovo, addressing the need for objective, quality and sustainable reporting on the country's many challenges. BIRN Kosova has been engaged by DEMOS to facilitate the Social Audit process in the five selected projects in Drenas, Suhareka, Kaçanik, Hani i Elezit, and Vitia.

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	6
Methodology	10
Work map	12
The environment in which the Social Audit process takes place	13
Chapter I - Findings in the process of consultations with citizens	15
Insufficient documentation in minutes	15
Individualization of group requests by citizens	16
Poor performance by facilitators	16
Discussing the investment project with the community	17
Lack of public documents about the project	17
Chapter II - Findings in the planning process	19
Lack of design capacities in the Municipality	19
Lack of designing access for people with disabilities	19
The Park, an unfinished project	20
Lighting and maintenance	21
Workplace safety and environmental impact	21
Chapter III - Findings in the contracting phase	22
Contracting Process	22
Contract for additional work	23
Miscalculation of positions	23
The new contract for the park	24
Chapter IV - Findings in contract implementation	25
Lack of carrying out works according to dynamic	25
Findings from the technical acceptance of works	26
Lack of safety at the workplace	27
Conclusions/recommendations	28
Letter of the Mayor of Hani i Elezit	31
Letter of the Social Audit team in the Municipality of Hani i Elezit	32
Commitment of the Municipality of Hani i Elezit to address the recommendations	33
Social Audit Team in Hani i Elezit	41

Executive Summary

In 2022, the DEMOS project team implemented the capacity building program for a group of civil society activists, with the aim of increasing their capacities to facilitate the process of Social Audit in the community.

Being a new concept in Kosovo, Social Audit was being implemented by DEMOS and Civil Society Organizations in 2022, and the first reports published during that year enabled concrete changes in the audited projects.

Who finances the Social Audit?

Work in Social Audit teams is voluntary and does not require payment for the group members. Social Audit Teams can make requests to independent donors to support them in covering all of their travel or visit expenses.

As the program continued, a team from BIRN trained by DEMOS mid 2023 began implementing a program aimed at creating five Social Audit teams in five different municipalities.

Hani i Elezit is one of the beneficiary municipalities. In June, BIRN contacted and selected the members of the Social Audit team at Hani i Elezit, and after the two-day training started the 7-month Social Audit process.

In accordance with the established methodology and recommendations by BIRN, the group of citizens from Hani i Elezit founded the “Social Audit” team. They were assigned the tasks of analyzing and supervising the park construction project in Hani i Elezit and analyzing the process of public meetings and consultations in the Municipality of Hani i Elezit.

The Social Audit Team

Social Audit Teams are groups of citizens that come together in order to get involved in increasing the transparency and accountability of public institutions. These voluntary groups analyze processes in order to provide recommendations and greater involvement of citizens in decision-making.

This report provides data collected by the team between July and November 2023. The project monitored is the construction of “Isa Berisha” park, financed as part of the Municipal Performance Grant.

Using an established methodology, the team determined that:

- The construction project of the “Isa Berisha” park was requested by and needed for the community of Hani i Elezit.
- The team did not encounter/detect any violations in the procurement process for the selection of the company to implementing the project.
- The project was completed without regard for the Dynamic Plan, and with delays in carrying out the works.
- The implementation of the project did not jeopardize the funds benefited from the Municipal Performance Grant as it was implemented in optimal terms.
- Investments have not fully met the needs of the community.
- The park project has been finalized, but three bunkers located inside the park have not been addressed in the first phase. Currently, they are unused and provide shelter for dangerous people.
- The municipality has failed to plan the irrigation system as the well opened to irrigate the park has no water.
- Due to the lack of an irrigation system, some trees and grass in the park have dried up during the summer when there was a lack of rain.
- The park was not planned to be family friendly and suitable for people with disability.
- The park is missing chairs and toys for disabled people.
- There were no covered areas accessible by people with disability.
- Some of the sidewalks are not suitable for people with disability.
- The lighting of the sports field is connected to the electrical system of the High School and not to the lighting of the park, therefore the sports fields can only be used in natural light.
- During construction, the park was not a safe workspace due to the lack of fencing in its entirety
- Investments in the park were damaged during the development of the works, but also after they were completed.
- The 2-hectare park does not have any public toilets, although at the public hearing citizens had requested that toilets be part of the project.
- There is no public tap in the park for water supply for park visitors. This as well was made as a request by the citizens in the public hearing that was held for this project by the Municipality of Hani i Elezit.

What does a Social Audit team need to know?

Social Audit teams do not need to be highly professional. Teams need civic will and courage, and it is recommended to have basic knowledge in how the following function:

- Municipality operations
- Access to public documents
- Public consultation process, especially during budget planning and investments in the municipality
- Public Procurement process

A special focus has been devoted to the transparency and publicity of the project. The team determined that:

- The Municipality of Hani i Elezit has not conducted a special public discussion for the park project.
- The municipality made public the contract signed between the municipality and the construction company, but it was not in full. In the contract published at the e-procurement platform, the works that were envisaged to be carried out, as well as prices for each position were missing.
- The municipality had not proactively published other documents; supervision reports or payment invoices are not public on the website of the municipality.
- The executive construction project document was not public on the website of the municipality either.
- The executive project of the “Isa Berisha” park was provided to the Social Audit team after requests for access to public documents were sent.
- In the projects information board, the Municipality of Hani i Elezit had not informed the citizens of the name of the project supervisor and contacts.
- On the website of the Municipality of Hani i Elezit there is no list of names of municipal officials involved in the supervision of the projects.

In addition to analyzing the planning and implementation of the project, the Social Audit team in Hani i Elezit also addressed the transparency of the Municipality towards the citizens. The team determined that:

- The municipality of Hani i Elezit makes serious efforts to involve citizens in public meetings.
- Multiple platforms are used to encourage citizens to be part of public meetings and discussions.
- In the public discussions, infrastructural requests dominate, and for the most part, they are presented as individual requests.
- Citizens have little information about the destiny of the requests they submitted in the past years.
- The documentation of public meetings is carried out through short minutes, which do not entirely represent the content of the meeting.

Methodology

This report presents data gathered from interviews, requests for access to public documents, site visits and talks with the community. At the beginning of May, DEMOS and BIRN, based on established standards, selected 5 projects in 5 municipalities of Kosovo to be included in the Social Audit process.

Who establishes the Social Audit team?

Social Audit teams are independent from institutions and can be established by representatives of the community but also by other groups. The teams function independently of the authorities and do not need approval from public institutions to be established.

The Municipal Performance Grant in 2022 financed 57 projects in 14 municipalities of the country. At the start of the assessment, the team excluded 4 municipalities from the selection, as they were included in a similar Social Audit project last year. In the other 11 municipalities, BIRN carried out field visits to see the situation on the ground and request information about the phases the projects were currently in. After receiving the report from the field, the team of DEMOS and BIRN evaluated the projects based on the following criteria:

- Project status (whether it is in completion, more than 50% of the works are completed, or it is in the initial phase);
- High or low impact on and targeting of marginalized groups such as women, youth, seniors, persons with disability and non-majority communities;
- Nature of project and area of impact, prioritizing the fields of education, health and environment;
- Value of grant allocated to carry out the capital project.

On the basis of these criteria, it was decided that the construction project in the municipality of Hani i Elezit of the “Isa Berisha” park will be monitored, in the municipality of Drenas the project for the construction of the wastewater collector, in Kaçanik the fire department building, in Suhareka, the project for the construction of the walking path and the construction of the Mushtisht - Guri i Matozit road and the Topliqan-Gjinoc road, and in the Municipality of Viti, the project for the renovation and expansion of the “Kongresi i Manastirit” road.

Who established the Social Audit Group in Hani i Elezit?

In accordance with an established methodology from DEMOS, BIRN drafted a list of representatives and professions that were to be invited to the Social Audit Team. The selection criteria stated that the group intended to prioritize the inclusion of women and marginalized categories of society such as women, youth, seniors, persons with disability and non-majority communities. The group was intended to have a range of professions and ages.

BIRN submitted to DEMOS the tentative list of occupations. After coordination, BIRN contacted the citizens of Hani i Elezit to ensure that the defined categories were included in the team.

After the project selection DEMOS and BIRN received letters of support from the mayors of the five municipalities to start the Social Audit process for the project. For the drafting of this report, the established Social Audit team used several techniques to collect data.

The team engaged in online research of the municipality's public data, drafted a list of over 50 questions related to the project and requested information from the municipality, sent requests for access to public documents and analyzed documents received by the Municipality. To document the findings, the team made field visits and held meetings with officials of the Municipality of Hani i Elezit.

Who are the members of the Social Audit team?

The members of the Social Audit teams are members of the community, who do not have a conflict of interest with the project. Officials of the institution directly related to the project and the process of official supervision of the project cannot be in the teams.

The data in the report were collected by the 22 members of the Social and the report was drafted with the help and support of BIRN. The report was made public after addressing the comments received by the Municipality of Hani i Elezit.

Team composition: 22 members



14 women or 63.7%



8 men or 36.3%

- Retiree
- Athlete.
- Student
- Economist
- Professor
- Handikos
- Person with disability
- Activist
- Pharmacist
- KSF member
- Resident

Work map

June 2023

- Visits on the ground
- Targeting and identification of profiles that will be part of the team
- Preparation of the list with the profiles of Social Audit team members
- Selection of the Social Audit team

July 2023

- Two-day training for Social Audit
- Creating a group on Viber
- Signing of the Memorandum of Understanding with the Municipality of Hani i Elezit
- The team's field visit with the mayor of Hani i Elezit
- Field visit of the Social Audit team to record the findings
- Checking accessible materials on open platforms

August 2023

- Appointment of persons within the team for sending requests to the Municipality
- Sent requests for access to public documents
- Meeting with the project manager and the chairman of Hani i Elezit
- Receipt of answers from the Municipality of Hani i Elezit
- Team meeting to analyze the public consultation minutes

September 2023

- Team communication with the Municipality of Hani i Elezit and persistence on receiving the rest of the answers and documents
- Receipt of other answers from the Municipality of Hani i Elezit
- Discussion and analysis of documents received by the Municipality of Hani i Elezit

October 2023

- Team meeting to analyze all documents received by the Municipality of Hani i Elezit
- Documenting the findings by the Social Audit team
- Assigning team report drafting duties
- Establishing the structure and defining the points of writing the report
- Assigning report writing tasks
- Drafting of recommendations by the team

November 2023

- Drafting the report on the findings and recommendations of the Social Audit team
- Report editing
- Addressing comments and suggestions

December 2023

- Sending the report for validation to the municipality
- Presentation of the report to the municipal officials
- Carrying out a media campaign to promote the report

The environment in which the Social Audit process takes place

Hani i Elezit is one of the smaller municipalities of Kosovo with 9,403 inhabitants, which in 2023 had a budget of 3,349,714 euros. Municipal budget is small and the assistance from the Municipal Performance Grant project had a high impact on the community. The data show that in 2022 the capital investment budget was 985,392 thousand euros, and the project financed by the Municipal Performance Grant was vital for the community as it constitutes over 25% of the total investment budget in the Municipality of Hani i Elezit.

The municipality decided to invest the Municipal Performance Grant money in the construction of the “Isa Berisha” park. Hani i Elezit is among the most polluted municipalities in the country, and the area where the park is located was a dangerous and unmaintained area before the project. The area was recognized as a military zone and the community had requested that the area undergo a regeneration process.

Municipal Performance Grant

The Municipal Performance Grant is a fund that is allocated to municipalities that have had good governance. In 2022, 14 municipalities benefited from this grant thanks to their good governance. The grant is funded by the EU, the Government of Switzerland, Sweden and Norway. In 2022, the municipalities have benefited about 8 million euros from the Municipal Performance Grant. The project is managed by Helvetas Swiss Intercooperation Kosovo.

The municipality of Hani i Elezit is among the most polluted municipalities in the country and the need to have a park to fight pollution has been a request of the citizens for many years. It is worth emphasizing that in the minutes of public debates in the past years 2018-2019-2020, there is a request from citizens for green spaces.

The project, which was financed by the Municipal Performance Grant, “Regulation of the park on Isa Berisha street (paving, sidewalk, public lighting, greenery) - first phase, has a value of 243,936 euros. The contract for this project was signed on July 22, 2022 with the company “Murseli Company” SHPK. For the same project, an annex-contract worth 9,998 euros was signed with the same company on December 22, 2022. Whereas, for the second phase of the project, the contract was signed on May 29, 2023 in the amount of 19,999 euros.

The project “Regulation of the park on Isa Berisha street (pavement, sidewalk, public lighting, greenery)” was drafted by “ALBA GROUP” whereas project manager, appointed by decision of the mayor, was Durim Dernjani.

The Social Audit team assesses that Hani i Elezit has a lack of green spaces and did indeed need this park. It is estimated that this project has a positive impact on its visitors, such as children, pensioners, women, athletes, people with disability, students and pupils.

Key findings

During the Social Audit process in Hani i Elezit the team addressed a range of topics discovered during document analysis and field visits. The team found problems in the preparatory phase of the tender, especially in the design of the park. Delays were found in the implementation phase of the project. Other problems that accompany the project are the lack of investment maintenance and the need for additional investments.

What is the impact of Social Audit?

The Social Audit in the Municipality of Hani i Elezit had an impact on the improvement of park management. The team ensured that bunker doors are locked, cameras installed in the park and lighting is provided for the football field.

The team found that Hani i Elezit should advance further in the direction of public consultations phase . The findings are grouped into four chapters:

- Findings in the process of consultations with citizens
- Findings in the planning process
- Findings in the contracting stage
- Findings in contract implementation

Chapter I - Findings in the process of consultations with citizens

Hani i Elezit has about 9 thousand inhabitants. The Municipality of Hani i Elezit consults citizens throughout the year using various techniques, including direct meetings with citizens and formal public consultations. In the initial analysis, it was found that the Municipality held public meetings and consultations and published the materials on their official website.

Insufficient documentation in minutes

The Social Audit Team has analyzed the minutes of the public consultations of the years 2020, 2021 and 2022. The group has determined that in public debates aimed at citizen involvement and presentation of their demands in order to be included in budget planning, the citizen turnout is low. The exception in the Hani i Elezit is the village of Goranca, where the largest turnout was observed.

During the analysis of documents, it was determined that in public debates, most of the participants were men, and their requests were usually related to infrastructural problems, lighting and drinking water. The team has found that in public discussions infrastructure issues continue to dominate citizens' demands.

The Mayor of the Municipality of Hani i Elezit has an advancement in organizing public debates, calling all the stakeholders that work and operate in Hani i Elezit. He has called a special public debate with youth, NGOs that represent youth interests, students, sports clubs, and representatives of Handikos. Likewise, a special debate was held with the representatives of villages such as Paldenic, Seçishte, Gorance, Lagje e Re and Krevenik.

From the analysis of the minutes, but also from discussions with representatives of the organization Handikos, the group found that the Municipality of Hani i Elezit includes people with disability in public discussions and provides spaces that enable their participation.

During the analysis of the materials, the group found that the municipality did not present the entire content of the meetings in the minutes. In some cases, citizens' demands are written in less than one line and contain no justification as to why those demands are relevant. In one of the cases analyzed, it was written that a citizen requested that the river bed be cleaned. Some of the members of the Social Audit team that participated in this public discussion, consider that citizens had spoken at length about their request, arguing that the bed should be cleaned due to floods and that the area is at risk.

Individualization of group requests by citizens

Another element that the group has highlighted during discussions is the individualization of requests. In the minutes analyzed, the group found that requests that are often done in groups are attributed to a single citizen and this shows a loss of legitimacy of the request.

In the meetings the public consultations of which were analyzed, several challenges were identified that should be addressed in the future. The group has determined that municipal officials that organize and carry out public consultations, do not provide enough information at the start of the meetings regarding what happened to their requests submitted in the previous year. In the absence of this information, requests are repeated or not submitted at all, thus causing a decline of trust in the process.

Poor performance by facilitators

The Social Audit Team has concluded that the facilitators of public discussion meetings fail to provoke debate and pose questions to the community regarding their needs. The team determined that facilitators should be proactive and provoke the community whether they need certain investments. The team has determined that facilitators need to advance in their preparation in order to increase performance.

The role of facilitators in public discussions

The role of facilitators in public discussions should be more proactive. Facilitators should encourage citizens' involvement in discussions about municipal projects and budget. They should provoke debate and elicit ideas and proposals from participating citizens.

As part of regular meetings, municipalities hold meetings for the Mid-Term Budget Framework, meetings with municipal mayors, consultative meetings with various directorates and consultative meetings for the budget.

Hani i Elezit, in addition to the meetings in question, which are mandatory, has advanced further and decided to conduct a consultation meeting with the citizens for the project in question. The citizens were invited to a presentation where the project was presented and citizens' comments were received.

During documents analysis, the Social Audit team identified that a public discussion was held with the citizens of the area for the project in question. The municipality has confirmed that a meeting was held and the demands of the citizens were included in it.

Discussing the investment project with the community

The Municipality of Hani i Elezit has held a public discussion with citizens dedicated to the project for the regulation of the “Isa Berisha” park. The meeting was held on March 1, 2022, and 28 people signed the list of participants. The municipal officials presented the project to the citizens and discussed it. Citizens have given ideas about regulating the park to include all ages, some have asked for more green spaces and some have asked for a fitness corner.

The team has identified that the Municipality of Hani i Elezit discussed with citizens the requests for concrete platform and other proposals which have been discussed with the community.



Lack of public documents about the project

The team also addressed the issue of whether the project documents were public and easily accessible to citizens. As far as the publicity of the project materials is concerned, the team found that on the website of the Municipality there are some materials published about the project, but some important materials are missing. It was found that the the contract signed between the municipality and the construction company had been made public, but it was not in full. In the contract published at the e-procurement platform, the works that were envisaged to be carried out, as well as prices for each position were missing. This important document was then made accessible to the team after sending requests for access to public documents.

The team also found that the Municipality of Hani i Elezit had not proactively published other documents; supervision reports or payment invoices are not public on the website of the municipality. The team also got hold of these materials through requests for access to public documents.

During several months of work, other elements of accountability were addressed and analyzed as well. An important element that the team found was the fact that the citizens of the area had no knowledge of who the project supervisor was. The supervisor is a significant official to whom any problems and irregularities in certain projects can be reported. The team determined that in the projects information board, the Municipality of Hani i Elezit had not informed the citizens of the name of the project supervisor and contacts.

Contract supervisor

The contract supervisor is a person or company engaged by the municipality. They are responsible for overseeing each phase of contract implementation. The supervisor drafts reports for each phase.

Also, the team found that on the website of the Municipality of Hani i Elezit there is no list of names of municipal officials involved in the supervision of the projects. After a request for access to public documents, the team managed to find the name of the contract supervisor and discussions with him helped the team to understand more accurately and clearly the project implementation process.

Chapter II - Findings in the planning process

The Social Audit Team has analyzed the documentation provided by the Municipality of Hani i Elezit, which show how the project was designed and what changes were made along the way. In the design phase, public institutions ensure they have foreseen every detail in the project. This includes the appearance of the project, materials that will be used, quality of materials and the architecture of the project. The team found that the design of the park had some delays which caused problems during implementation.

Lack of design capacities in the Municipality

The municipality of Hani i Elezit is a small municipality and within the administration there is no capacity to design and develop large projects. As a result, the municipality is obliged to contract a private company for the design of the park project.

The Social Audit team analyzed the manner in which the park project was designed and checked whether the design was envisaged to meet the needs of the citizens. The project was designed by a private company “Alba Group SHPK”, since the municipality does not have its own designing team. The team has found that some defects in design have created problems in the implementation of the project on the ground. Also, the team initially found that the executive project of the park was not published on the website of the municipality and the citizens did not have the opportunity to check every detail of the project.

Lack of designing access for people with disabilities

The first issue that was addressed by the team was the adaptation of the project for people with disabilities. The group found that the designer did not make sure to guarantee space for people with disabilities.

There is no parking space marked for persons with disability near the park. The entrance to the park is narrow and cannot be used by some wheelchairs models used by people with disability. The municipality argued that the entrance is according to standards.

The group found that the park has no sidewalks and signs for the blind, and no acoustic means for them. Also, it was found that the chairs placed in the park are not marked for people with disability and there are no special models for them.

The verandas placed in the park are equipped with tables and chairs and accessing them by people with disability is impossible. The group also found that the designer had not installed playgrounds and recreational equipment that can be used by people with disability.



The Park, an unfinished project

The municipal investments of Hani i Elezit in the park do not fully meet the need to address that area. Three military bunkers are located in the space of the park and they are not renovated or maintained. One of the bunkers has a broken door and poses a risk to the community as there are problematic people staying there at night. After a request by the Social Audit group, the doors of the bunkers have been fixed and locked.

In the design, the municipality planned for the park to have an irrigation system. An entire irrigation system is constructed, including a well. However, the Social Audit team found that the well was not well planned as it has no water. The well is without water at a depth of 5 meters, and as a result the whole system is non-functional. Some trees in the park have gone dry due to lack of water and the grass has gone dry in the summer. The municipality of Hani i Elezit said that the trees will be replaced while additional investments will be needed to improve the irrigation system.

The group also found that there are investments in the park that no one knows the purpose of. A horse that has been placed in the park was found several times to have been knocked down by careless persons, whereas the municipality said that this investment was made in order for citizens to make photo-shoots next to it.

In the initial project, the team found that no monitoring system with security cameras had been planned for the park, however, after consultations with the Social Audit group, the municipality installed a monitoring system. The team also found other deficiencies that require new investments in the park. The area does not have a public toilet and citizens have no restroom to go to when in need. Also, there are no public taps installed in the park spaces for drinking water.

Lighting and maintenance

Another issue that the group addressed is the poor design of the public lighting system. The Social Audit group observed on the ground that the public lighting for the sports field located in the park is connected to the electricity of the nearby school. As a result, the lighting of the field is stopped at 20:00, once the school is closed.

This has made it impossible for the field to be usable for activities after 20:00, especially during the summer months.

After meetings and consultations between the Social Audit team and Municipal officials of Hani i Elezit, this issue has been resolved. The group also found that the municipality has not yet built a safe system for park maintenance. As a result, lacking supervision, it may continue to deteriorate in the future.

The park does not have a permanent maintenance guy that would look after the area and there is no automatic irrigation system which would ensure that the park is always kept green.

Workplace safety and environmental impact

When analyzing the documents, the Social Audit team was also focused on the damage to the environment this project does. Because it is a park, and there are green spaces, the team concluded that the project did not have a negative impact on the environment. The team has determined that the project has had a positive impact on the environment as it has marked an expansion of green spaces and trees planted, and an area previously abandoned, containing a lot of waste, has been transformed into a clean and green area.

In the minutes of public consultations analyzed, the group identified there were proposals for the park to have more concrete, but the municipality, referring to environmental standards, did not agree to this. Even the materials used during construction have been assessed to be such that don't cause pollution or irreparable damage to the environment and fauna.

The workplace safety during the implementation of the project is another element which has been analyzed by the Social Audit team. The team found that the company did not ensure the workplace to make it a 100% secure area. To secure the workplace, some wires and in some cases even tape were used, and the data show that the citizens had unobstructed access to the area where the construction works were carried out. According to the Law on Safety and Health at Work, only people authorized by the company and equipped with protective equipment are allowed to enter construction sites.

Also, the team found that due to the lack of security at the workplace, in some cases there had been materials stolen, which were later compensated by the company.

Chapter III - Findings in the contracting phase

The Social Audit team has also analyzed the contracting process of the project. At this stage, the group found that the contracting process went without problems and without complaints to the contracting authorities, however, the team found that the municipality was obliged to sign an additional contract in this project due to inadequate work planning.

Contracting Process

During the work of several months, the Social Audit team also analyzed the public documentation from the tendering process of the project. The tender for the “Regulation of the park “Isa Berisha” (pavement, sidewalk, public lighting, greenery) was announced on May 22, 2022 by the Municipality of Hani i Elezit. 9 economic operators bid in this tender. The Municipality of Hani i Elezit recommended for contract the Economic Operators Group “Murseli Company” & “Marisa” who had offered in the amount of 243,936 euros. Three other economic operators had submitted cheaper offers, but they were eliminated from the competition and did not file a complaint.

EO “ATC COM” was eliminated from the competition as their offer was not administratively complete because according to the municipality, “in the list of equipment, the truck registrations were expired”. EO “Bejta & Grand Construction & NBT ing - Gjilan” was eliminated on the grounds that “the leader does not meet the required criterion of at least 60% of references according to the required criterion of 375,310.00 euros”.

Whereas, EO EDONA & ELEKTRA - Ferizaj was eliminated from the competition on the grounds that “in the machinery portfolio, the truck registration cards, they have sent a tipper truck and another truck, which does not meet the required criteria. The required criteria were 2 tipper trucks, thus you do not meet the required criteria”.

No	Name and address of Economic Operator	Total bid value
1	GOE “Murseli Company” & “MARISA”	243,936.04 €
2	OE “ATC COM”	253,373.42 €
3	GOE. “EDONA” & “ELEKTRA”	249,667.28 €
4	GOE “Bejta Commerce” & “Grand Construction” & “NBT-ing”	250,404.04 €
5	GOE “Parajsa” & “Infinet Engineering” & “Modeli Invest”	204,484.72 €
6	GOE “TOPALLI” & “Besa Company”	235,859.28 €
7	OE “Mete Bytyqi”	216,272.00 €
8	GOE “Global Holding” & “Bujar Shabani” B.I	247,901.88 €
9	GOE “ARLINDI” & “Pro Co Group”	248,717.26 €

On July 22, 2022, the Municipality of Hani i Elezit signed a contract for the “Regulation of the park “Isa Berisha” (pavement, sidewalk, public lighting, greenery) with the economic operators group “Murseli Company” & “Marisa”. Contract value is 243.936 Euros. The team found that the signing of the contract was done within a short period of time, as there were no complaints. This has caused the works to start on time and as a result, the donors’ funds were not risked, as this had happened in other municipalities.

Contract for additional work

The Social Audit Group found that there were issues in the contracting process, as the municipality had not planned all the works. As a consequence, the municipality was obliged to sign an annex-contract for additional work.

During the analysis of the documents, the Social Audit team came across an annex-contract signed between the Municipality of Hani i Elezit and the consortium “Murseli Company” & “Marisa”. The value of this annex-contract is 9,998 euros or 4.10% of the value of the basic contract, which had a value of 243,936 euros. The annex was started on December 22, 2022 and was planned to last 10 working days.

The audit team found that there had been deficiencies in planning and as a result the contract manager on the ground had requested these works. In the document file of this contract there is a request by “Murseli Company” & “Marisa”, for additional work in the amount of 9,998 euros, dated December 12, 2022. It envisaged to carry out some works that had not been foreseen by the project, including some changes that were made at the request of the contract manager. The municipality said that changes and additional works had been carried out after there were interventions with concrete and the walls of the bunkers were destroyed.

Miscalculation of positions

During the analysis of the documentation, the team has found that the municipality was forced in some cases not to carry out some poorly planned works and to replace them with other works. According to the rules of the contract, if the contract has envisaged for a material to be placed in a certain area but it is not needed, then the managers can replace it.

Based on the documents of this tender, it results that there was a decrease but also an increase in the contracted quantities for some positions of the contract. In a letter dated December 5, 2022, made by the project manager Durim Dernjani, there was a request by the Mayor of the Municipality, Mehmet Ballazhi, for additional work to be allowed, namely a change of positions. In this letter it was stated that “we have encountered some deficiencies in the project/bill of quantities and calculations in relation to the situation on the ground, and some necessary work has been identified which must be carried out to complete the project” . This request also lists the work that does not need to be carried out and the positions that require more work than what was contracted. In this letter, the project manager has said that the changes within the contract and contracted positions do not exceed the value of the contract.

One of the changes made in this contract is work in fencing. For example, there were 252 meters of galvanized and laminated wire fencing were contracted, which was planned to be placed on existing poles. The price per meter was 10 euros. This position was increased from 252 meters to 345 meters in length, a difference of 930 euros. However, a position that was decreased was for the fence and the installation of steel posts at every 2 meter distance. Based on the data of the contract, fewer poles were installed than planned and the value of the implementation dropped from 4,300 euros to 2,800 euros, or 75 meters less in terms of length. Apart from this, there were changes made in atmospheric sewerage works and on the sidewalks.

The new contract for the park

The Social Audit team also found that not all the works related to the construction of the park were planned in the basic contract. To fill the gap of some unplanned investments in the first contract, the Municipality of Hani i Elezit signed another contract for the same park. This contract was titled “Regulation of the park on “Isa Berisha” street (paving, sidewalk, public lighting, greenery) - second phase. The contract was signed on May 29, 2023 in the amount of 19,999 euros. This contract was signed with the same operator that had constructed the park, the “Murseli Company” & “Marisa” consortium. This contract provided for several new positions: the construction of a playground, a slide at the playground, as well as some animal sculptures. In addition, this contract also provided for the installation of 13 security cameras in the park. About three months after the signing of the contract that provided for the installation of cameras, on February 15, 2023, the company carrying out the works in the park reported to the police a case of damage to the works in the park. Eventually, the cameras were installed in the park.

Chapter IV - Findings in contract implementation

The most important phase of the implementation of works in an investment contract is project management. The Social Audit team analyzed whether the works were performed according to the contract and the deadlines.

The Municipality of Hani i Elezit signed a contract worth 243 thousand euros on July 22, 2022 with the company “Murseli Company” & “Maris”. In the contract, it was stipulated that the works will start 5 days after the signing of the contract and they would be finalized within 6 months.

Lack of carrying out works according to dynamic

The Social Audit team requested the Dynamic Plan of the works from the municipality, one of the basic documents for the carrying out of works. The team was told by the Municipality of Hani i Elezit that there is a Dynamic Plan, but works had not been carried out in accordance with it due to several reasons. According to the Municipality, the plan was not implemented because of precipitation and also because two bunkers that risked collapsing had to be removed within the space of the park. The municipality also claims that the Dynamic Plan could not be carried out because there was damage to the project by irresponsible persons who stole materials from the workplace.

According to the contract, the contractor had to complete the works on January 22, 2023. However, the data show that the works were finalized only in June 2023, that is a delay of about 5 months. The economic operator “Murseli” SH.P.K sent a letter to the Municipality of Hani i Elezit by which it requested that the completion time of the works be extended for another 60 days. This request was sent to the Municipality on April 14, 2023, after the company exceeded the deadline for the works. The same company had sent a letter to the Municipality on June 16, 2023, by which it confirmed that all the works had been completed and requested an appointment of a Commission for Acceptance of Work.

The Social Audit team concluded that based on the dynamics of work completion and the company’s letter for work completion, there was a six-month delay in finalizing the works.

In the Special Terms of the Contract, it was foreseen that the municipality has the possibility to fine 0.20% per day of work not carried out, and the maximum amount that can be liquidated is up to 10% of the value of the contract. In addition, the Procurement Law and the signed contract (Article 19) gives right to the Municipality to, in addition to penalties, even terminate a contract with an economic operator in case of delays in the execution of works. The municipality has not informed the Social Audit group whether it has imposed a fine on the implementing company for the delay in the works.



Findings from the technical acceptance of works

The Municipality of Hani i Elezit appointed a Commission for Acceptance of Works, which consisted of Adnan Lusnjani, Fatbardha Bushi and Daut Dernjani. The Audit Group found that the Commission for Acceptance of Works had visited the site to see if the completed works were in accordance with the signed contract.

Technical Acceptance Committee

The Commission for Technical Acceptance is a professional team of the municipality, which at the end of the project inspects the works and based on the report of this team, the works are accepted and then payments are made.

The Social Audit Team has analyzed the technical acceptance report for the project submitted to the Procurement Office on July 4, 2023. In this report, the Technical Acceptance Commission had identified some observations in the implementation of works.

- Replacement of seedlings that were in an unwell and unacceptable condition. A total of 15 seedlings.
- Improvement of concrete cubes, which had suffered subsidence in two specific locations.
- Improvement of areas planted with grass in certain locations.
- Repainting wooden seats.
- Fixing some sprinklers of the irrigation system, which did not have a well-adjusted sprinkle direction, as well as the replacement of a damaged sprinkler.
- Replacement of a damaged bunker window.

The commission had given 5 days to fix these issues. The same commission drafted and submitted a works acceptance report on July 11, 2023. In this report, it was found that the comments the commission had provided had been addressed in accordance with the request. The Technical Acceptance Commission has found that “the works were performed in order, quality and quantity, on time, within the deadline specified in the signed contract” . This was the conclusion even though in the contract management file there are documents from the economic operator and the Municipality of Hani i Elezit that state that there were delays in the execution of works, with justifications about atmospheric conditions and damages caused during the execution of the works.

Lack of safety at the workplace

The team found that the workplace was not properly secured during the construction phase of the park. The team found that the company had not surrounded the area with a secure fence, which would have prevented access by unauthorized persons to the entire area.

In the absence of a secure fence, the area was affected by irresponsible persons, who have stolen materials belonging to the execution company.

Conclusions/recommendations

At the end of the project, the Social Audit team analyzed the work and reached some conclusions.

- As a result of the work of the Social Audit team, the doors of the bunkers which were initially found open were closed thanks to an intervention by the Municipality.
- The public lighting in the sports field was fixed to work after 20:00 as well, thanks to communication between the team, the Municipality and the school director.
- The camera surveillance system in the park has been installed.
- The team has received serious commitment that issues raised about disabled access will be addressed.
- The team determined that the Municipality of Hani i Elezit has been willing and ready to cooperate with the team and address the issues raised. Also, the team drafted a list of recommendations for the Municipality of Hani i Elezit.

What happens to recommendations?

The recommendations of the Social Audit groups serve to improve governance. The recommendations will be used to improve future projects and to improve the current project.

Recommendations for citizen involvement:

- The municipality should continue the practice of holding meetings with the community for projects like the park and include their suggestions in the project.
- In order to implement a process of civic supervision, the municipality is recommended to increase transparency towards citizens through:
- Publication of more documents about projects, including the design and the full contract with the economic operators.
- Publishing other documents produced during project supervision, such as the supervisor's reports or the technical acceptance reports.
- Place on information boards names of contract supervisors or addresses where citizens can send information.
- Publish a list of names of persons involved in the supervision of municipal projects on the municipality's page.

- In the process of meetings and consultations with citizens, the Municipality is recommended to change the manner of organizing meetings/consultation with citizens. Focus on providing more information about what happened to requests submitted by citizens in the past, as well as more detailed and easier-to-understand information about the municipal budget.
- The team recommends that the Municipality train public consultation facilitators through special programs to develop their capacities for provoking debate and promoting topics, as well as eliciting new project proposals in the community.
- The municipality is recommended to change the process of documenting public meetings. Minutes and reports from these meetings should be more detailed and comprehensive, containing all data from meetings.
- The municipality is recommended to start developing online platforms to involve more citizens in public consultation meetings.

Recommendations for the project planning process:

- In the planning of large projects, the municipality is recommended to plan the carrying out of all works and not only a part of it.
- The municipality must ensure that each project is carried out in accordance with the standards so that the spaces are adapted for persons with disabilities.
- The municipality must conduct preliminary studies on the condition of terrain before deciding to go with an installation of a certain system, such as irrigation.
- Municipal infrastructure projects must be connected to public electricity supply systems and be independent from other institutions.
- Sufficient funds must be allocated in the planning of works in order to implement the Law on Health and Safety at Work.
- Project time planning should be better, in order to guarantee timely implementation of projects.

Recommendations for the project supervision process:

- The supervision of the works process should be more active and prevent the possibility of various damages to the project.
- Supervisors must identify damages before the end of the project.
- Supervisors must record every case when the company is not respecting the rules of safety and health at work.
- The contract manager must keep minutes after each visit and meeting with the contractor.

Recommendations for new investments in the project

The Social Audit team discussed and determined that the park project in Hani i Elezit needs additional investments and interventions. Therefore, the group recommends to the municipality:

- To intervene and ensure an irrigation system for the park.
- To intervene and ensure an maintenance person for the park.
- To intervene and adopt the park for access for people with disability.
- To install seats and tables suitable for people with disability.
- To install signage for persons with disability.
- To ensure parking around the park for persons with disability.
- All sidewalks and walking paths must be accessible to persons with disability.
- To build public toilets in or around the park.
- To install a tap for drinking water in the spaces of the park.
- To hold a public discussion and decide on the fate of the bunkers located in the park.

Letter of the Mayor of Hani i Elezit

When I received the notification from the DEMOS project team dated May 5, 2023 that the Municipality of Hani i Elezit is one of the municipalities selected to have social audit for the project "Regulation of the park on "Isa Berisha" street, financed by the Performance Grant, I welcomed it and approved it within half an hour, and I expressed my full readiness as Mayor of the Municipality, and the readiness of my municipal team and other municipal officials to provide any documentation and information you would request.

The social audit is one of the most important and necessary processes for the municipality of Hani i Elezit, which is aimed at identifying the needs and concerns of our community regarding the Isa Berisha park, and through this process shortcomings and opportunities were investigated with the aim of improving the quality of life of our residents through projects implemented with municipal taxpayer money of the Republic of Kosovo.

Now, after 8 months, we are in the phase of accepting the Social Audit Report, and we have reviewed every line of it and we realize that not only the Isa Berisha park, but we can improve all projects which have an impact on the community, both in terms of planning, but also in terms of documentation and maximum transparency.

It has been a special privilege for us to have been selected to carry out the social audit in one of the most meaningful projects both in terms of infrastructure, but also in terms of historical and emotional value, thus we are committed to identifying any shortcomings, and taking into account any suggestion and recommendation that will come to us, and there will definitely be opportunities to carry them out, and we will make an action plan and identify the implementation of the recommendations from the Social Audit Team Report.

In closing, I express my gratitude and appreciation to DEMOS for the financing of the project, BIRN Kosova as its implementer, the members of the Social Audit team for their time and dedication, as well as the Municipal Officials for their readiness.



Letter of the Social Audit team in the Municipality of Hani i Elezit

For our Social Audit team it was something completely new, something that we as a team and as citizens had not heard or known about before. After the first meetings and the two-day training we held with the BIRN team and DEMOS representatives, we began to understand the role and importance of Social Auditing as a process.

During these training meetings, we learned many important things about our rights that we have as citizens in the process of decision-making, transparency and accountability. We learned how a project is designed and how it goes through institutional channels.

We were informed about the public procurement process, the stages and preparations of a public tender.

We as a group think that the process of the Social Audit in Hani i Elezit has been very necessary and useful for us citizens regardless of differences, but at the same time useful for the municipality as a public institution that aims to improve our lives.

We wish and hope that in the future there will be such processes which aim to raise citizen awareness in regards to decision-making processes.



Recommendations for citizen involvement

Recommendation of the Social Audit team



- The municipality should continue the practice of holding meetings with the community for projects like the park and include their suggestions in the project.

The commitment of the Municipality of Hani i Elezit



We have adhered to, and will continue to adhere to, Law No. 03/L-040 on Local Self-Government. This law is now integrated as Article 80 in the Statute of Hani i Elezit Municipality, document number 01. No. 4240, dated May 30, 2023 Article 10, points 1 and 2, of the Administrative Instruction (MPL) No. 03/2020 regarding Transparency in Municipalities. In line with your recommendation, we plan to increase community engagement through more frequent meetings on various projects that impact the community. The Social Audit process has reinforced the importance of designing projects with the community in mind. By involving a broader range of stakeholders in these meetings, we aim to gain a wider array of perspectives, enriching our approach.

- In order to implement a process of civic supervision, the municipality is recommended to increase transparency towards citizens through:

- Publication of more documents about projects, including the design and the full contract with the economic operators.
- Publishing other documents produced during project supervision, such as the supervisor's reports or the technical acceptance reports.
- Place on information boards names of contract supervisors or addresses where citizens can send information.
- Publish a list of names of persons involved in the supervision of municipal projects on the municipality's page.

The municipality of Hani i Elezit is committed to full transparency and is prepared to publish all pertinent documentation. This includes detailed project plans, comprehensive contracts, cost estimates and pricing, special contract terms, and the names of project supervisors, managers, and all other individuals involved in oversight. Notably, since January 2022, all decisions made by the Mayor have been compiled into a PDF file. These documents are published in a designated section on the official website of the Municipality within 10 days of the subsequent month. Furthermore, we will ensure that every decision concerning the appointment of project managers and supervisors is made more accessible to the public. These will be displayed on the notice board at the entrance of the Municipality building, which has recently been digitized.

Recommendations for citizen involvement

- ➔ In the process of meetings and consultations with citizens, the Municipality is recommended to change the manner of organizing meetings/consultation with citizens. Focus on providing more information about what happened to requests submitted by citizens in the past, as well as more detailed and easier-to-understand information about the municipal budget.

Your recommendation is indeed appropriate, and it's possible that we have previously implemented it in some meetings but not in others. Additionally, it might have been omitted from the minutes due to adhering to a specific format. We acknowledge that incorporating this recommendation could significantly boost citizens' confidence in the municipal institution, thereby potentially increasing public engagement and turnout.

Moving forward, we will give special attention to the preparation of the draft budget and other municipal plans slated for public consultation, as mandated by legislation. Our focus will be on providing accurate, detailed, and more comprehensible information to facilitate better understanding and engagement from the public.

-
- ➔ The team recommends that the Municipality train public consultation facilitators through special programs to develop their capacities for provoking debate and promoting topics, as well as eliciting new project proposals in the community.

We have had excellent collaborations with organizations that have provided us with training in various fields, both in procedure, behavior and knowledge of the law, for both political and civil staff; training from bodies such as IKAP, which we will look into finding methods for training facilitators to elaborate topics and encourage discussions with participants, as only in this way we can get as many proposals, suggestions and recommendations as possible.

Recommendations for citizen involvement

- ➔ The municipality is recommended to change the process of documenting public meetings. Minutes and reports from these meetings should be more detailed and comprehensive, containing all data from meetings.

As we have mentioned above, we will create another way of keeping minutes, and in the introduction part we will provide even the smallest but relevant details to be identified. We should bear in mind that it was quite difficult to keep the minutes by hand and record with a dictaphone trying not to have anything escape without being addressed in discussion, plus the fact that the officials who kept the minutes had other positions as well, some even having additional duties, therefore keeping minutes of every detail was difficult, thus we were not able to present all the details of the discussions. However, we are considering the possibility of digital transcription of public debates and other important meetings, such as those of the Board of Directors, Municipal Assembly meetings, Municipal Committee meetings, etc.

-
- ➔ The municipality is recommended to start developing online platforms to involve more citizens in public consultation meetings.

We have just started sending invitations to public debates through electronic messages on the phone, social networks, emails, announcements on the official municipal and Mayor's websites, as the two most followed pages, but also with physical invitations to representatives of institutions, businesses, NGOs, residences and villages in visible places, but also through the heads of Local Councils. This way of calling/inviting has had a positive effect, and we have increased the number of participants, especially women, Handikos members, NGOs, etc. by a good percentage. However, participation in public consultations continues to be a problem, but we are focused on sending the information to every home.

Recommendations for the project planning process

- ➔ In the planning of large projects, the municipality is recommended to plan the carrying out of all works and not only a part of it.

The objective of the Municipality is to bring and implement projects that have an impact on the improvement of the daily life of the residents of our city. The limited budget of the Municipality of Hani i Elezit in terms of capital investments has often made for even bigger projects that we have written to either be put on hold until a donor shows up, or until something comes up from the central level, or we have to implement in parts. Projects that are carried out part by part and which take time to complete, often see details emerging along the way, but there is sometimes no other way but to plan them part by part. In fairness, without wanting to excuse ourselves, we accept your recommendation and will make an effort to initially make our projects large and impactful in the community, and designed down to the smallest detail.

- ➔ The municipality must ensure that each project is carried out in accordance with the standards so that the spaces are adapted for persons with disabilities.

One of the criteria that we take into account every time, both at the start of procurement procedures or in other projects, not limiting only in infrastructure ones, is to have equal access for everyone, including people with disability. In this case, we will increase control in project supervision and we will make more stringent the process of technical acceptance of works, taking into consideration the standards for equal access.

- ➔ The municipality must conduct preliminary studies on the condition of terrain before deciding to go with an installation of a certain system, such as irrigation.

Considering the problem we encountered during the summer season, the lack of irrigation of the greenery in the "Isa Berisha" park, which caused drought, and it was a very bitter experience for us, we will take special care so that this problem is not repeated in future projects.

Recommendations for the project planning process

- Municipal infrastructure projects must be connected to public electricity supply systems and be independent from other institutions.
 - Sufficient funds must be allocated in the planning of works in order to implement the Law on Health and Safety at Work.
 - Project time planning should be better, in order to guarantee timely implementation of projects.
-

In 2024 onwards, we will make sure that the projects be adapted to the specific season, as we have encountered problems with projects that have been delayed due to wet weather and this has cause works to be interrupted, delaying the time of completion of works.

Recommendations for new investments in the project

The Social Audit team discussed and determined that the park project in Hani i Elezit needs additional investments and interventions. Therefore, the group recommends to the municipality:

- To intervene and ensure an irrigation system for the park.

The budget allocations for 2024 have already been fully utilized, leaving us with a limited budget of only €543,000 for capital investments. This constraint has also significantly limited our planning capabilities. Consequently, investing in a sophisticated irrigation system will be quite challenging. However, we maintain excellent cooperation with local stakeholders, ensuring that when automated irrigation for green areas is not feasible, manual methods such as the use of tanks will be employed for irrigation.

- To intervene and ensure a maintenance person for the park.

The municipality of Hani i Elezit has a memorandum of cooperation with NPL 'Pastrimi' in Hani i Elezit. According to this agreement, in exchange for the agreed payment, NPL 'Pastrimi' is committed to maintaining public spaces, which includes the 'Isa Berisha' park. However, the prospect of directly hiring a maintainer is slim to nearly impossible. This is due to the fact that within the approved quota for civil officials, there are no vacant positions suitable for a maintainer/cleaner/administrator role. The available vacancies were for different positions, which were identified as essential and missing, impacting the workflow as per existing laws and regulations. To address this, we will enhance our collaboration with NPL 'Pastrimi' to ensure they can allocate a dedicated worker/maintainer for the park.

Recommendations for new investments in the project

- ➔ To intervene and adopt the park for access for people with disability.
- ➔ To install seats and tables suitable for people with disability.

We will conduct a reassessment of all areas, including the park entrances, seating areas, play areas, sidewalks, tables, porches, and so on. If these areas require substantial intervention that incurs high costs, we will defer these projects to the year 2025. However, we are committed to making every possible effort to implement the recommendations outlined in your report, seeking alternative funding sources where feasible.

- ➔ To install signage for persons with disability .

Concerning the recommendation to install signage for persons with disabilities, we will conduct a detailed assessment of the park areas to accurately identify where such signage is needed. This includes the placement of notice boards in designated areas for people with disabilities. However, the installation of acoustic systems might be challenging to achieve in 2024. Nevertheless, we do not rule out the possibility of their implementation in 2025.

- ➔ To ensure parking around the park for persons with disability.

The parking area designated for the kindergarten and park space fulfills the requirements to serve as a parking area for people with disability. Its proximity to the park and ample space makes it suitable, and implementing the necessary signage will be straightforward once we get the green light.

Recommendations for new investments in the project

- ➔ All sidewalks and walking paths must be accessible to persons with disability.

We will also highlight areas that might be challenging for people with disability to access. The year 2025 could present budgetary opportunities for planning necessary modifications. However, a detailed financial assessment is required to determine feasibility, and if possible, interventions might even be initiated in 2024.

- ➔ To build public toilets in or around the park.

For the current year, we have already initiated a procedure, and a contract has been signed for the installation of sewer systems in various locations, including the 'Isa Berisha' park. This development marks a significant step towards the potential installation of a public restroom in or near the park.

- ➔ To install a tap for drinking water in the spaces of the park.

With the water treatment plant in operation in the village of Dimce and the supply of drinking water in the urban areas of the city, the installation of a public tap becomes increasingly essential. We are keen on installing it; however, an alternative solution could be the drilling of a well. This would be contingent upon a thorough analysis to determine the feasibility of such an undertaking. If feasible, it would provide park visitors with convenient access to drinking water.

Recommendations for new investments in the project

- ➔ To hold a public discussion and decide on the fate of the bunkers located in the park.

With the preservation of the bunkers, as historical artifacts, our objective has been to repurpose these structures, which once served as gathering places for the former Yugoslav army. Beyond their historical significance, we aim to use them for positive community engagement. One proposal, endorsed by the Mayor, is to transform one of the bunkers into a small museum. This space could host various cultural events, such as book fairs, photography and art exhibitions, and could resonate well with a large segment of the citizenry. This initiative would symbolize the transformation of a once fearsome bunker into a hub of culture and development. Additionally, there's potential to rent out other bunkers for business activities. The revenue generated from these rentals could fund the hiring of a maintenance worker for the park. While we have entertained various suggestions, we plan to hold a public debate to determine the final course of action regarding these bunkers.

Social Audit Team Report in Hani i Elezit

No.	Name	Occupation/Function
1	Hamide Livoreka	Athlete
2	Ajferre Curri	Athlete
3	Teuta Hasallari	KVRL
4	Blerta Hasallari	KVRL/Environmental activist
5	Visar Hasallari	Chairman of KVRL/student
6	Zgjim Qajani	Athlete
7	Altina Mici	Athlete
8	Jolinda Mici	Athlete
9	Lejla Bela	Athlete
10	Zirafete Ramuk	Handikos/Person with disability
11	Nerxhivane Berisha	Handikos/Person with disability
12	Rabiye Berisha	Handikos/Assistant of a person with disability
13	Xhelsime Berisha	The mother of Isa Berisha, the person the park is named after
14	Muhamet Berisha	The father of Isa Berisha, the person the park is named after
15	Bidajet Kalisi	KSF - Deminim
16	Xhelil Berisha	Retired
17	Shefket Lusjani	Retired
18	Isuf Berisha	Retired
19	Ardit Kuka	KVRL
20	Nurdane Kuka	KVRL
21	Arbenita Bajrami	Professor
22	Era Bajramaliu	Athlete



Co-funded by
the European Union



Schweizerische Eidgenossenschaft
Confédération suisse
Confederazione Svizzera
Confederaziun svizra

Swiss Agency for Development
and Cooperation SDC



Sweden
Sverige



Norwegian Embassy